

**BEFORE THE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL,
PRINCIPAL BENCH, NEW DELHI**

**Original Application No. 237 (T_{HC}) of 2013
(M.A. No. 389 of 2014, M. A. No. 1145/2015,
M. A. No. 1250/2015, M. A. Nos. 324/2016 & 325/2016)
And
Original Application No. 492 of 2014**

IN THE MATTER OF:-

**Court on its own Motion Vs. State of Himachal Pradesh & Ors.
And
Abhimanyu Rathor Vs. State of H.P. & Ors.**

**CORAM : HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SWATANTER KUMAR, CHAIRPERSON
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE M.S. NAMBIAR, JUDICIAL MEMBER
HON'BLE PROF. A.R. YOUSUF, EXPERT MEMBER
HON'BLE MR. BIKRAM SINGH SAJWAN, EXPERT MEMBER**

	Date and Remarks	Orders of the Tribunal
	Items No. 1 and 2 May 09, 2016	<p>When the matter came up for hearing on 7th April, 2016 the Tribunal passed the following order.</p> <p>“In furtherance to our earlier orders of the Tribunal the State of Himachal Pradesh has filed a status report dated 04th April, 2016 on record of the Tribunal. We had also directed the Senior Offices to be present to provide a final shape to the directions issued by the Tribunal in its earlier order in relation to various facets for maintaining environmental and ecological balance in one of the beautiful Himalayan peaks falling in Rohtang Pass. Both aspects are required to be dealt with, that is prevention and control of pollution on the one hand and restoration and rejuvenation of the Rohtang Pass in terms of ecology and environment on the other.</p> <p>Mr. Sanjay Gupta, Principal Secretary, Transport, Mr. R.D. Dhiman Principal Secretary, Transport, Deputy Commissioner, Kull, Mr. S.P. Sharma , Chief Operating Officer from GAIL Gas Ltd., Mr. Praveen Agrawal, Director, Ministry of Heavy Industries, Govt. of India and Mr. Kunal Dubey, Deputy Manager from Ministry of Petroleum is present before the Tribunal. However, no officer is present on behalf of the MoEF.</p> <p>First and foremost, we would like to deal with the issue in relation to CNG and electric buses to be made operative in Rohtang Pass and surrounding areas of Manali onwards. As per the status report the State has submitted as follows:</p> <p>“<i>Transport Department:</i> <i>The latest status as intimated by the transport Department is as follows:</i></p> <p>1. <i>Operation of CNG:</i> (a) <i>That Government of Himachal Pradesh</i></p>

has accorded approval for the purchase of 10 No. CNG Buses to Himachal Road Transport Corporation (HRTC). Tender process for the purchase of these buses has been completed. Further process is on hold till the availability of the CNG.

(b) An amount of Rs. 81.00 lacs has been sanctioned by the government for purchase of three caskets (Trucks) Three LCV/medium vehicles for transportation of CNG from Tahliwal (MBS) to Manali (DBS).

(c) That for the establishment of Mother Booster Station (MBS) at Tahliwal land has been transferred in the name of the Department of Transport and the Government has accorded permission to lease out the said land to GAIL gas Ltd. The RTO Una has been asked for preparing estimate for fencing the premises. Site selection for Daughter Booster Station (DBS) at Manali has been finalized by the GGL on 29th October, 2015, formal approval is awaited. Whereas case is being prepared for the grant of forest clearance for the establishment of (DBS) at Manali.

(d) That it is pointed out by the Transport Department that the department is not in a position to bear the Capex Cost to the tune of Rs. 17.5 crore for the establishment of CNG Stations at Tahliwal and Manali, as there is no such infrastructure at its own cost. The State Government has already taken up the matter with the Secretary, Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas (MoPNG), GOI to bear the cost or issue necessary directions to M/s GGL to bear this cost. The letter from the Pr. Secretary (Transport) to the Secretary Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas (MoPNG), GOI, is annexure as "Annexure R-1".

(e) Retail cost of CNG at various locations upstream of the MBS would sequentially rise till the last DBS, as the haulage cost of CNG from the MBS to various DBS can be done only through Light Commercial Vehicles (LCVs). In fact, it would be highest at Manali, the last point in the supply chain in the CNG infrastructure. The same would have to be borne by the consumers or vehicle owners unless the retail price of the CNG can be made standard through some mechanism. The State Government has already taken up the matter with the Secretary, Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas (MoPNG), GOI, (Annexure R-1) to subsidize the retail price of CNG to be supplied to the consumers at Manali to make it cost effective and also to encourage its usage being Eco-Friendly. Accordingly, it is prayed the necessary directions in this regard may kindly be issued to GOI.

2. Operation of Electric Buses

(i) The Ministry of Heavy Industries has approved Rs. 1.50 crore each for the purchase of 25 No. of Electric Buses subject to the finalization of specifications by Government of India. The Tender process shall be initiated by the Govt. of

H.P. thereafter.

(ii) *Hon'ble Chief Minister, Himachal Pradesh has announced exemption for Token Tax, Registration Charges and VAT on all electrical vehicles in order to promote eco-friendly transport services in the State in his Budget speech."*

From the above it is clear that the State is making every effort to implement the directions and protect the environment of the Rohtang Pass and the Glaciers around it. They have expressed their financial limitations, as one of the main obstacles for not complying entirely with the directions of the Tribunal.

Learned Advocate General appearing for the State of Himachal Pradesh has submitted that they have already placed an order for purchase of 10 CNG, buses but an additional expenditure of Rs. 17.5 crores has to be incurred for establishment of CNG Station at Tahliwal and Manali. Learned counsel appearing for the GAIL Gas Limited (GGL) submits that they have planned installation of mother booster Stations at Tahliwal and Daughter Booster Station at Manali. It is confirmed on behalf of the State of Himachal Pradesh that land has already been earmarked and handed over to the Transport Department for installation of Mother Booster Station at Tahliwal and land had been identified at Manali for Daughter Booster Station. The papers would be submitted shortly to the competent Authorities.

Learned counsel appearing for the Ministry of Petroleum submits that they are not having any policy to support the State Government for establishment of such CNG Stations. In the light of this, we issue the following directions:-

1. The State of Himachal Pradesh shall without fail commence the CNG Bus Stations in the coming season.
2. The land would be handed over to the GGL for construction and establishment of the mother Booster Station at Tahliwal and Daughter Booster Station at Manali within three weeks from today. The work thereupon will be commenced immediately thereafter.
3. As far as the land at Tahliwal is concerned no other clearance is required and the work must progress without default.
4. The land allocated for Daughter Booster Station at Manali the Application would be submitted by the State of Himachal Pradesh within one week from today and the same shall be disposed of by MoEF within two weeks thereafter. Upon clearance being granted, the work of Daughter Booster Stations shall also be commenced without default.
5. We direct Secretary of Ministry of Petroleum to consider the case of the State of Himachal Pradesh for financial assistance in relation to Rs. 17.5 crores expenditure to be

incurred in that regard. Under the Federal structure of our Constitution, environment being Central subject, it is expected that both the Governments would put their means together to achieve the object of clean environment, which is a fundamental right of the citizens. This will not only be an environmental activity but would add revenue to the State Government as well as Central Government. We are hopeful that the Petition filed on 02nd April, 2016 should be considered by the Ministry at the earliest, in spite of the Reply already sent by the Ministry. We direct that the Ministry should consider the same objectively and purposefully. It is a joint responsibility of the Central and State Government to maintain clean environment and protect its natural resources which is the constitutional mandate.

6. We also direct to GGL to make its contribution to this project in lieu of its corporate social responsibility. It cannot be said to be a commercial activity. It is for a public purpose and is the environmental responsibility.

Thus, we direct Secretary of Ministry of Petroleum to take up a meeting within one week from today and with the State of Himachal Pradesh, GGL and other concerned and take a final view on the matter afore-indicated. Compliance thereof would be submitted to the Tribunal immediately thereafter.

7. Learned counsel appearing for the Vehicles Owners Associations of that area submits that they would be very glad to make their contribution by purchasing CNG Buses, if the CNG is made available in that area. Besides that, they also want to make collective contribution by purchasing the CNG buses if the State would permit and that would also reduce the liability of Rs. 17.5 crores to a larger extent and the expenditure incurred in future would be reduced. We find this suggestion purposeful and bonafide. Let the Secretary present before the Tribunal consider this proposal expeditiously and provide a hearing to the vehicle owners associations before taking a final view.

Learned counsel appearing for the GGL submits that they would comply with all the requirements and guidelines issued by Petroleum and Natural Gas Regulatory Board (PNGRB).

Coming to the electric buses, it has been stated that the proposal is acceptable to the State and the Officers present bind the State Government in relation to the report submitted. The State of Himachal Pradesh is ready with 25 % of the expenses to be incurred for purchasing the 25 electric buses which would be started primarily in the area in question and could be used even for other places after the season.

We direct the Ministry of Heavy Industries to finalise the design and specifications of the tender in consultation with the State of Himachal

Pradesh. We are told that the meeting is fixed on 12th April, 2016. On that date the specifications would be finalized, whereupon the State of Himachal shall invite tenders for supply of all these buses within two weeks thereafter.

The copy of the tender issued shall be placed on record of the Tribunal.

The expenditure of the buses shall be borne in the ratio of 25% and 75% by the State and Central Government. The State of Himachal Pradesh have further provided incentive for the persons using electric vehicles, as toll tax, registration charges and VAT would not be payable by the them. The State of Himachal Pradesh shall also consider similar benefits to the CNG vehicles as well. The Government should also consider purchase of hybrid buses.

Steps would be taken by the State of Himachal Pradesh to finalise the purchase of these vehicles expeditiously and the Ministry of Heavy Industry would provide help to the State of Himachal Pradesh in that regard.

The ropeway from Palchan to Rohtang project should be expedited. We direct the project proponent to take steps without further delay and default, and submit the compliance report. It is submitted that as per the Memorandum of understanding, the schedule for different phases have been fixed. The State to place the compliance report to this effect before the Tribunal.

We direct the Deputy Commissioner Kullu, SDM Manali and SP Manali to submit a complete and comprehensive report upon actual physical verification of the site as to the maintaining of checkpost, online monitoring and checking of vehicles, issuing permits and if any suggestion they propose to make for the purpose of including implementation of the directions issued by the Tribunal. Depending on this report we would consider the variation in the number of vehicles that can be permitted in the coming season. Presently Rohtang pass is not open to the visitors. We direct the same committee to give us the complete comprehensive report in relation to installation of Temporary Toilets at Rohtang Pass. The same committee would jointly inspect all the snow scooters and report to the tribunal as to how many snow scooters are petrol operated/battery operated and how many are diesel operated. They will also state if they are having two stroke or four stroke engines. The committee would also identify the portion if any, in consultation with the Director of HFRI, Shimla, where the snow scooter if at all can be permitted to be operated during this season. This very committee would also identify the take-off and landing point of paragliding.

List these matters on 08th April, 2016.”

2. As would be evident from the above, the order primarily related to plying of CNG and/or electric buses in this eco-sensitive area at Manali-Rohtang. Further, a Committee was constituted to submit a report upon physical verification in regard to various matters as directed under various orders of the Tribunal.

3. Compliance report/affidavit dated 18th April, 2016 was filed. In this affidavit effort was made to show that the directions of the Tribunal were being complied with. It was stated in this report that for Snow Scooters areas were identified at Rohtang Top, Beas Nala, Sagu Fall and at Gulaba. For Paragliding, it was stated that two sites have been identified, one at Solang and the other at Marhi.

4. The Committee appointed under the orders of the Tribunal reported that the sites were visited on 16th April, 2016 and check-posts established at Bahang and Gulaba were found to be functional, equipped with technology and computer system in all respects. Reports were also submitted in relation to Snow Scooters under both the categories of 4 stroke snow mobile and 2 stroke snow mobiles. Out of total number of 85, 41 snow scooters were stated to be unregistered.

5. Affidavit on behalf of the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas was also filed in furtherance to the Order dated 7th April, 2016. It was stated in this affidavit that two meetings were held on 12th April, 2016 and 14th April, 2016 with the officials of the Government of Himachal Pradesh, GAIL, GAIL Gas and PNGRB. The Minutes that have been placed on record show that GAIL, GAIL Gas and representatives of the Government of Himachal Pradesh

were to work out a sustainable business model within 4 weeks to consider the capital cost of Rs. 17.50 crores as it had feasible alternatives to avoid such capital expenditure.

6. It was contended that the 2 stroke snow scooters are bound to cause greater air pollution and affect the glacier and its surrounding areas. It was also stated that the report submitted by the Committee is factually incorrect and the state of affairs prevailing actually at the site are in much worse conditions than is being depicted in the reports. There is traffic chaos, greater pollution and degradation of environment and ecology of this eco-sensitive area. The State of Himachal Pradesh in all the hearings has been taking up the stand that it really wants to implement the directions issued by the Tribunal with utmost sincerity and effectiveness. Even the Learned Advocate General, who appeared before the Tribunal on a number of occasions, reiterated such a stand of the State and prayed for some variations in the orders of the Tribunal to implement them effectively and efficaciously. The directions were varied to some extent to accept the contentions of the State and make the directions more practicable but without any serious or adverse impact on the environment and ecology of the eco-sensitive areas. However, we are pained to notice that despite such unequivocal stands of the various departments of the State of Himachal Pradesh they are found wanting practically in all the areas. It is primarily with regard to afforestation that some effective steps in consonance with the Judgment of the Tribunal have been taken. But, in all other fields the implementation of directions requires

greater seriousness and implementation from the State.

7. The Tribunal has not passed any Orders with variation or contradiction. The Orders were reiterated time and again. However, limited variations were done at the behest of the State to enable them to implement and enforce the directions with greater effectiveness. However, as already noticed, the State has been found wanting in relation to most of them. The State has prayed for certain further relaxation or variation of directions, on the ground that the State's revenue is suffering, people have lost their employment and commercial viability is a pertinent consideration. We are not oblivious of these conditions but under the garb of these conditions the State and the people at large cannot be permitted to destroy the natural assets irreversibly. The Doctrine of Public Trust imposes an obligation not only on the State but even at the public at large to maintain its natural assets in a condition in which it was received by them, if not in a better condition, to the next generation. The degradation of environment and ecology of the eco-sensitive area is now a publically known fact and can be taken judicial notice of by the Tribunal.

8. Persistent degradation of environment and ecology and damage to the glacier and its surroundings compels us to pass appropriate directions in consonance with the main judgment of the Tribunal. Furthermore, the traffic hazards and serious emissions is causing reduction of the glaciers. It is necessary to protect the environment and ecology of that area, for which we pass the following directions:

		<p>I. The State of Himachal Pradesh has prayed for relaxation in certain directions issued by the Tribunal, more particularly relating to operation of paragliding, snow scooters and other activities which according to them are non-polluting as well as number of vehicles. We do not find merit in all the contentions raised on behalf of the State of Himachal Pradesh in relation to the activities but some of them could be permitted to be started in restricted areas with an object to examine if the State Government and its authorities are able to maintain proper check and balances and carry on the activity without causing any pollution of the area in question. As far as Rohtang is concerned, we are completely unsatisfied with the proposals made as it is an extremely eco-sensitive area and cannot be subjected to further degradation on the mere assurance that the State Government would take appropriate steps. It will be appropriate to permit some activities to the State Administration at lower levels and thereby observe the consequences thereof upon the environment and ecology. The eco-friendly market at Marhi has not been made operational fully despite the fact that more than 2 years has passed since passing of the Judgment by the Tribunal. It is a partial attempt being made by the State. The State claims that it has identified the zones where Paragliding and snow scooters would be permitted. After considering the assurance given by the State in its affidavit and reports, we permit the following limited activities for a</p>
--	--	---

limited period, subject to filing of the report by the Local Commissioners that would be appointed in this order.

A. Only 4 stroke snow scooters would be permitted to operate at Beas Nala to Sagu Fall and at Gulaba. Not more than 50 4 stroke snow mobiles would be permitted at both these sites collectively.

B. We also permit Paragliding which shall be permitted at Solang and Marhi and at both the places the paragliding would take place within the identified areas and it would be ensured that the persons carrying on paragliding and the tourists do not generate any municipal solid waste at the take off point and/or landing points. Strict vigil shall be maintained to ensure that the toilets fixed at these sites are eco-friendly and are cleaned everyday and the waste collected is transported to the appropriate sites and is not dumped anywhere around the eco sensitive areas at these places.

C. The persons involved in providing Dress/Local Dresses (Pahari Dresses) for photography purposes would be permitted to carry on their activity at Rohtang, Gulaba, Solang and Marhi. The persons who are given permit to carry on this activity would be licensed and would carry on that activity strictly as per the terms and conditions of the licence to be provided by the concerned State Authority.

The State Authority shall ensure that they also do not generate any kind of waste at any point and in the event of breach of terms and conditions of the licence, their licence shall be liable to be terminated and thereafter they would not be permitted to carry on the said activity.

The camera man or the people providing these services would not be permitted to carry on any other ancillary activity or carry any kind of eatables at any of the identified sites.

D. All tearing vehicles shall be operated only at Solang to Bahang and Marhi to Sagu Fall. Not more than 50 ATVs shall be permitted to run in these areas, that too, subject to verification and on the defined routes.

E. No activity of any kind would be permitted at Rohtang Pass except providing of local dresses and photography. The Tribunal would consider permitting other activities at Rohtang only after receipt of the report of the Commissioners that are appointed under this order. For the present, we make it absolutely clear that no other activity or business, snow scooters, ATVs and horses except the ones specifically permitted above and visiting of the tourists will be carried on at Rohtang Pass and its surrounding areas.

F. That at least 30 eco-friendly toilets would be provided at Rohtang Pass and they shall be cleaned every day. The waste/sewage extracted shall be transported to an appropriate site at

Kullu/Marhi and would not be dumped in any other area. The concerned Authority particularly, Department of Tourism and other environmental agencies shall maintain due record thereof.

G. The Municipal Waste from all places shall be collected on a day to day basis and transported to the appropriate site.

Complete and comprehensive record on that behalf shall be maintained.

It has been stated on record that the cleaning and collection of the municipal solid waste is outsourced to a private agency on an annual contract of Rs. 13, 90,000 annually. In the event of any default, the persons responsible for throwing the municipal solid waste including the private agency responsible for collection of the same would be liable to pay Environmental Compensation of Rs. 5000 per event if the garbage or municipal solid waste is found outside the dustbins meant for that purpose. Collection of waste would be the responsibility of the private agency and there should be no garbage or plastic lying on the roads.

H. We permit 800 petrol vehicles to go to Rohtang per day instead of the 600 provided in the main judgment. We particularly deny any increase in the diesel vehicles which would be maintained at 400. All these vehicles which have maintained emission standards would be permitted to go to Rohtang. All these vehicles would operate as per

the terms and conditions imposed by the authorities and the orders passed by the Tribunal earlier.

- I. No Horses would be permitted at Rohtang at the first instance. Not more than 200 horses would be permitted at all other marked and specified routes. These horses are to be registered and to be examined for health issues like Glanders before they are permitted to operate.

The mule/horse owners would be permitted to make associations of licensed horses and they would be responsible to maintain absolute cleanliness, i.e., collection and disposal of municipal solid waste along with the concerned authorities. The mule/horse dung shall be collected from the sites at Marhi, Solang, Sagu Fall and Gulaba. It will be ensured that the horses are permitted only on the marked routes and there is due procedure for collecting the horse dung. The owners of the horse will be provided permissions/licences for carrying on this activity. In the event any mule dung is found on the marked routes the licensor would be liable to pay Rs. 5000 as Environmental Compensation in equal shares. Besides that, the licence shall be terminated and cancelled. No temporary sheds would be permitted at Rohtang which provide eatables, tea and other facilities.

- J. The authorities particularly the tourism department shall it display boards of Do's and

Don'ts at various places.

II. We further direct the State of Himachal Pradesh to submit a comprehensive status/compliance report in relation to:

A. Ropeway.

B. Operationalization of CNG and electric buses.

C. Its submission of plan to the Competent Authority in terms of the minutes of the meeting dated 12th April, 2016 and 19th April, 2016 taken by the Secretary, MoP&NG.

D. State of Himachal Pradesh in consultation with NEERI to submit complete and comprehensive status report in relation to carrying capacity of Rohtang Pass, Marhi, Solang, Gulaba and other tourist spots in that area on all aspects of environment.

E. The State of Himachal Pradesh shall submit a complete and comprehensive report in relation to compliance of various directions contained in the judgment dated 6th February, 2014 and orders dated 20th November, 2014, 6th July, 2015, 16th July, 2015 and 7th April, 2016.

F. Collection and disposal of Municipal Solid Waste/ garbage and all other kinds of wastes at all points particularly, Rohtang, Marhi, Solang, Gulaba and Beas Nalla etc. shall be reported.

G. Status with regard to afforestation.

H. Status with regard to establishment of Eco-friendly market at Marhi.

I. The projected aspects of expenditure from and how

much money out of money collected under the Head 'Green Tax/Environmental Compensation' payable by tourist taxis and all other aspects in that behalf shall be stated by the State Government.

III. That we appoint the following Local Commissioners who shall visit Rohtang Pass, Solang, Marhi and Gulaba and file a comprehensive report before the Tribunal in relation to compliance of the terms and conditions of the Judgment dated 6th February, 2014 and orders passed thereafter, particularly this order. They would pay greater emphasis as to the impact on environment and ecology, waste management, level of pollution and blackening of snow in that area. The Local Commissioners shall submit a report to the Tribunal within 3 weeks from the date of passing of this Order. We appoint the following Local Commissioners:

1. Ritwick Dutta, Advocate
2. Tarunvir Singh Khehar, Advocate
3. Neelam Rathore, Advocate
4. Pradeep Mishra, Advocate
5. Anil Grover, Advocate
6. Mukesh Verma, Advocate

The Commissioners will visit Manali, Solang, Vashisht, Gulaba, Marhi, Kothi and Beas Nalla. They will visit in the teams of two, i.e., Local Commissioners appointed at Sr. No. 1 & 2 together, 3 & 4 together and 5 & 6 together. Their fee is initially fixed at Rs. 40,000/- each, which shall be paid by the State of Himachal Pradesh at the first instance and would be subject to final

orders passed in the petition. Besides fee, expenses of travelling and residing at Manali would also be provided by the Department of Tourism, State of Himachal Pradesh.

All authorities concerned, particularly, the Deputy Commissioner and the S.P, Kullu are directed to provide all help, assistance and security to the Commissioners appointed by the Tribunal and ensure that they can carry-out commission effectively and without obstruction of any kind.

It is necessary for the Tribunal to have before it the response of concerned authorities as afore-indicated and authenticated report from an independent agency (Local Commissioners) and expert bodies, before it can pass further final directions as well as to consider whether the Show Cause Notices issued to the various departments of the State of Himachal Pradesh should be finally withdrawn or in order to enable it to pass such appropriate orders as may be necessary. The present status, compliance report, report of the Commissioners should inter-alia but primarily be submitted on the following:

- A. Establishment of barriers, including technical support systems in terms of the directions, regular checking of pollution of vehicles, whether all vehicles going to Rohtang are possessed with the requisite permissions or not and establishment of toilets and sanitary facilities?
- B. Compliance of complete prohibition of use of any kind of plastic including plastic plates, glasses, carry bags and other packaging material. Moreso, its absolute

compliance at Rohtang Pass.

C. Present status of providing of eco-friendly toilets at Marhi and to which extent the project has been carried forward. Providing of eco-friendly toilets at Rohtang and other eco-sensitive areas covered under the Judgment.

D. Status of the measures taken and reforestation at Kothi, Gulaba and Marhi.

E. Status with regard to establishment of Eco-friendly market at Marhi

F. Removal of encroachments from government land and forests.

G. CNG/Electric Busses.

H. Collection and disposal of municipal waste and placement of requisite dustbins at all relevant places.

I. Relief and rehabilitation plan of State in relation to house owners, taxis, particularly, diesel taxis, partial rehabilitation and incentive program for the people involved in tourism activities in these areas.

J. The development of eco-tourism should be strictly in compliance with the orders of the Tribunal. Any violation thereto, shall be viewed seriously and appropriately dealt with in accordance with law.

IV. A team of Scientists from Ministry of Environment and Forests and Central Pollution Control Board and a Scientist from Centre for Glaciology - Wadia Institute of Himalayan Geology and a Scientist from the Ministry of Earth Sciences (dealing with Glaciers) will visit Rohtang and its surrounding areas and submit a report to the Tribunal as to the current impact of vehicular emissions

		<p>and other emissions upon the glacier, environment and ecology of Rohtang Pass and its surrounding areas particularly of <i>CO₂</i>, <i>CO</i>, <i>PM 2.5</i> and soot.</p> <p>By this order we hereby dispose of M.A. NO. 215 of 2014, M.A. 389 of 2014, M.A. 1145 of 2015, M.A. No. 1250 of 2015, M.A. 16 of 2016 and M.A. 324 of 2016.</p> <p>List M.A. 325 of 2016 for further directions.</p> <p>List this matter for further consideration and direction on 12th May, 2016 at Shimla Bench.</p> <p>.....,CP (Swatanter Kumar)</p> <p>.....,JM (M.S. Nambiar)</p> <p>.....,EM (Prof. A.R. Yousuf)</p> <p>.....,EM (B.S. Sajwan)</p>
--	--	--

